

Original Research

Maternal Deaths in Kayseri: Causes and Risk Factors

Mebrure Beyza Gökçek^{1,*}, Hümeyra Aslaner², Seçkin Özsaydı³

¹Family Phsician Specialist, Health Directorate of Kayseri, 38120 Kayseri, Turkey

Academic Editor: Ugo Indraccolo

Submitted: 10 August 2023 Revised: 29 September 2023 Accepted: 11 October 2023 Published: 25 October 2023

Abstract

Background: About a quarter of a million women die from pregnancy-related conditions every year. This study aimed to contribute to the literature by assessing causes and demographic data of maternal deaths in our region. **Methods**: Our study is retrospective and descriptive. The study sample comprised 36 mothers who died in Kayseri between 2015 and 2019. The assessment was performed on the Provincial Directorate of Health data-"Maternal Death Record Forms". Patients' demographic and clinical characteristics and the factors associated with mortality were analyzed. **Results**: A total of 33 maternal deaths that occurred between 2015 and 2019 were assessed in our study. The mean age of mothers included in the study was 33.3 ± 6.3 . Median gestational week was 24.5 (min: 3–max: 39) weeks of pregnancy. The majority of preventable deaths were from indirect causes. Cesarean history was higher in previous pregnancies in preventable maternal deaths (p = 0.006). First-phase and third-phase delay models were higher in preventable maternal deaths (p = 0.008). **Conclusions**: The rates of preventable maternal mortality are considerably high. The first-phase delay model has an important place in preventable maternal deaths.

Keywords: maternal death; maternal mortality; pregnancy; three delays model

1. Introduction

Maternal mortality is defined as maternal deaths caused by pregnancy or factors (direct) due to the pregnancy process or factors (indirect) aggravated by those during pregnancy, during delivery or within 42 days after delivery, regardless of the duration or place of pregnancy. Accidental factors are excluded from these causes [1].

About a quarter of a million women die from pregnancy-related conditions every year. Maternal deaths may have several causes. While the cause is mostly the difficulties in access to healthcare services in developing countries, maternal deaths are caused mainly by multiple risk factors (chronic disorder, obesity, smoking, etc.) in developed countries [2,3].

Maternal deaths are classified according to their causes and delay models. These models are described as three delays model by the World Health Organization (WHO). These models are, respectively, the delay developing due to the decision of receiving-seeking healthcare service, the delay developing due to access to a reasonable medical facility and the delay developing due to receiving sufficient medical care in a healthcare institution [4]. First phase delay generally occurs when the parents realize the condition late. Lack of medical knowledge is one of the most important causes of that. Second phase delay occurs due to poverty or living in a long distance from the healthcare institution. And third phase delay occurs generally due to misdiagnosis or insufficient treatment [5]. Many countries make an effort on different issues in order to decrease

maternal deaths and most of these efforts have brought in successful conclusions. While maternal deaths are still quite high in some countries they have decreased and reincreased in some others [6]. Maternal mortality is still a crucial global health problem to be solved [7]. This study aimed to contribute to the literature by assessing causes and demographic data of maternal deaths in our region.

2. Materials and Methods

2.1 Patient Population

Our study is retrospective and descriptive. Five-year maternal mortality data between 2015 and 2019 in Kayseri were assessed.

2.2 Objective of the Study

This study aimed to assess maternal deaths occurring in Kayseri between 2015 and 2019 and associated factors.

2.3 Setting and Sampling of the Study

The study sample comprised 36 mothers who died in Kayseri between 2015 and 2019. The assessment was performed on the data of the Provincial Directorate of Health-"Maternal Death Record Forms", and all samples were intended to be included in the study; therefore, no calculation was performed for sampling. Two of the maternal deaths were accidental; one was caused by a traffic accident, and the other was caused by murder, and one of them was young maternal death. After two accidental maternal deaths and one young maternal death were excluded from the study, 33 individuals were included.

²Family Phsician Specialist, Kayseri City Hospital, 38020 Kayseri, Turkey

³Public Health Specialist, Health Directorate of Kayseri, 38010 Kayseri, Turkey

^{*}Correspondence: beyzaozgun@gmail.com (Mebrure Beyza Gökçek)

2.4 Data Collection

Sociodemographic data of mothers who died and the data about date and gestation period of death, pregnancy outcome, place of birth, place of death, delivery method, classification of causes of death, preventability status, cause of death, cesarean history, number of primary, secondary and tertiary follow-ups, delay models, number of risk factors, edema, varicosis, blood pressure, pulse, and hemoglobin values, and presence of proteinuria were obtained from the file records that were regularly kept in Kayseri Department of Community Health Services. These file records are constituted based on the database of the national health system. The National Health System database is an online health record system comprising imaging methods, pathology data and blood tests performed in all healthcare institutions nationwide. Medications patients use, examination records and vaccination status can also be accessed on the system. Individuals authorized by the directorate can log in to this system.

Some of the babies were delivered as dead. Fetuses that had been accepted as dead with fetal ultrasonography in utero and had not been delivered at all were accepted as intrauterine death of the fetus.

Preventable maternal deaths are determined by the Maternal Mortality Review Committee of the Provincial Directorate of Health. The provincial health director, two specialists from anesthesiology and reanimation, two gynecologists, two pediatricians and two internal medicine specialists are in the commission. Physicians from other departments are included when needed. Two public health specialists and a family physician are generally included. Deaths have been classified by this commission as the first, second and third delay according to the Three Delays Model defined by the WHO. There is no second delay model in our study.

Kayseri is a medium-sized city with a population of 1,441,523 (Turkish population is 85,279,553) and ranking 17 in terms of socioeconomic development among 81 cities in Turkey. It takes place among secondary cities with a socioeconomic development index of 0.560. It is located in the Middle Anatolian region and neighbors several less-developed cities.

2.5 Statistical Analysis

SPSS version 22.0 (IBM Corp., Armonk, NY, USA) was used for analyses. Descriptive statistics were given as mean, standard deviation, median, minimum, and maximum values. Numbers and percentages were used for categorical data. Kolmogorov-Smirnov test was used to determine whether numerical data belonging to the variables were compatible with the normal distribution. Pearson's and Fisher's Chi-Square tests were used to compare categorical data. The two-sample Student *T*-test was used in normally distributed numerical data, and the Mann-Whitney U test was used to assess non-normally distributed two samples. The statistical significance level was accepted

as 5% in the calculations, and a *p*-value equal to or lower than this value revealed that the relationship between the parameters was statistically significant.

3. Results

The number of live births in Kayseri was 23,065 in 2015, 22,496 in 2016, 21,500 in 2017, 20,737 in 2018, and 19,477 in 2019 [8]. Maternal mortality rates (MMR) in Kayseri by years were 33.3/100,000 in 2015, 19.4 in 2016, 19.4 in 2017, 5.6 in 2018, and 22.2 in 2019 (refugees are not included in these data). A total of 33 maternal deaths that occurred between 2015 and 2019 were assessed in our study. The mean age of mothers included in the study was 33.3 ± 6.3 . Of the mothers who died, 87.9% were Turkish citizens, 81.8% lived in Kayseri, and 69.7% lived in the city center. While 30.3% of mothers were having their first pregnancy. The median duration from previous pregnancy was 4 (min: 1-max: 19) years. The median gestational week of mothers who died during pregnancy was 24.5 (min: 3-max: 39) weeks, and median number of postpartum alive days of mothers who died during their postpartum period was 8 (min: 1-max: 42) days. The median gestational week of preventable maternal deaths was 27 (9-39). Of the mothers, 69.7% had been followed up in a primary healthcare institution before delivery, and 93.9% had been followed up in any healthcare institution. Median number of follow-ups was 3 (min: 0–max: 7) in primary care, 3 (min: 0–max: 11) in secondary care and 3 (min: 0-max: 11) in tertiary care. In our study, there was at least one delay model in 53.1% of mothers who died. Details on the other data are presented in Table 1.

The mean Body Mass Index (BMI) of all mothers was 26.6 ± 4.5 . Mean BMI of preventable maternal deaths was 27.0 ± 5.7 . Mean BMI of non-preventable maternal deaths was 26.0 ± 3.0 . There was no significant difference between the two values (p = 0.513). Raw data of allcases are presented in Table 2.

The preventable maternal mortality rate was higher in winter (p = 0.004). When maternal deaths are assessed according to preventability, no significant difference was found in nationality, city, district, status of follow-up in primary care, educational status, place of death, type of delivery, gestational period of death, pregnancy outcome, edema, varicosis, and proteinuria (Table 3).

Cesarean history was higher in previous pregnancies in preventable maternal deaths (p = 0.006). First-phase and third-phase delay models were higher in preventable maternal deaths (p = 0.008, p = 0.007). For preventability, there was no difference in disease detected during pregnancy, number of risk factors, classification of causes of death, and causes of death (Table 4).

While the mean age of preventable deaths was 33.1 \pm 6.27 years, the mean age of unpreventable deaths was 33.9 \pm 6.51 years, and there was no significant difference between the two values (p = 0.721). There was a significant difference in pulse rate and hemoglobin values (Table 5).



Table 1. General Distribution Characteristics of Data.

Characteristics	Variables	n (%)
	2015	11 (33.3)
	2016	7 (21.2)
Year	2017	5 (15.2)
	2018	2 (6.1)
	2019	8 (24.2)
	Spring	10 (30.3)
Season	Summer	7 (21.2)
Season	Autumn	6 (18.2)
	Winter	10 (30.3)
	Illiterate	1 (3.0)
	Primary School	11 (33.4)
Educational Status	Secondary School	4 (12.1)
Educational Status	High School	8 (24.2)
	University	5 (15.2)
	Unknown	4 (12.1)
Devie 1 of Deval	2015 11 (3: 2016 7 (21 2017 5 (15 2018 2 (6. 2019 8 (24 Spring 10 (30 Summer 7 (21 Autumn 6 (18 Winter 10 (3) Illiterate 1 (3. Primary School 11 (3: Secondary School 4 (12 High School 8 (24 University 5 (15 Unknown 4 (12 Prenatal 8 (24 Post-partum 25 (7: Live 24 (7: Dead 9 (27 Tertiary Care 16 (4: Secondary Care 16 (4: Out of Healthcare Institution 1 (3. Tertiary Care 21 (6: Secondary Care 9 (27 Out of Healthcare Institution 3 (9. Cesarean 26 (7: Vaginal 3 (9. Intrauterine Death of Fetus 4 (12 Direct 8 (24 Indirect 24 (7: Undefined 1 (3. Preventable 17 (5: Non-preventable 17 (21: CVD 9 (27: Intracranial Hemorrhage Pneumonia 1 (3: Uterine Atony/Hemorrhage Preeclampsia/Eclampsia Amniotic Fluid Embolism 2 (6:	8 (24.2)
Period of Death	Post-partum	25 (75.8)
D	Live	24 (72.7)
Pregnancy Outcome	Dead	9 (27.3)
	Tertiary Care	16 (48.5)
Place of Birth	Secondary Care	16 (48.5)
	Out of Healthcare Institution	1 (3.0)
	Tertiary Care	21 (63.6)
Place of Death	Secondary Care	9 (27.3)
	Out of Healthcare Institution	3 (9.1)
Town of D. L'access	Cesarean	26 (78.8)
Type of Delivery	Vaginal	3 (9.1)
	Intrauterine Death of Fetus	4 (12.1)
	Direct	8 (24.2)
Classification of Causes of Death	Indirect	24 (72.8)
	Undefined	1 (3.0)
	Preventable	17 (51.5)
Preventability Status	Non-preventable	15 (45.5)
	Undefined	1 (3.0)
	Acute Pancreatitis	2 (6.1)
	Pulmonary Emboli	7 (21.2)
	CVD	9 (27.3)
	Intracranial Hemorrhage	2 (6.1)
	Pneumonia	1 (3)
Cause of Dooth		2 ((1)
Cause of Death	Uterine Atony/Hemorrhage	2 (6.1)
Cause of Death	-	2 (6.1) 3 (9.1)
Cause of Death	Preeclampsia/Eclampsia	
Cause of Death	Preeclampsia/Eclampsia Amniotic Fluid Embolism	3 (9.1)

CVD, Cardiovascular Disorder.

4. Discussion

Maternal mortality is an important marker of a country's level of development [9]. Despite several improvement efforts worldwide, declines in maternal mortality rates are unfortunately below par. In national data of Kayseri (refugee and foreign national mothers were not in-

cluded in these data), maternal mortality rates by years were 33.3/100,000 in 2015, 19.4 in 2016, 19.4 in 2017, 5.6 in 2018, and 22.2 in 2019. While the maternal mortality rate in Turkey was reported as 14.6/100,000 in 2015, it was 14.7% in 2016, 14.5% in 2017, 13.6% in 2018, and 13.1% in 2019 [10]. Kayseri is located in the Middle Anatolian region



Table 2. Descriptive Data of All Cases.

Patients	Age	P/NP	Cause of death	GW	Period of death	Type of delivery	Pregnancy outcome	Race	G	P	Previous c/s	BMI
P1	22	NP	AFE	34	Pre	С	L	T	2	2	N	23.87
P2	40	NP	CVD	3	Pre	IDF	D	T	3	1	N	26.84
P3	25	NP	CVD	12	Pre	IDF	D	F	2	0	Y	26.90
P4	25	NP	AP	28	Post	C	L	T	1	1	N	27.06
P5	41	NP	IH	32	Post	V	L	T	5	5	N	33.31
P6	31	NP	CVD	33	Post	C	L	T	3	3	Y	22.21
P7	39	NP	UAH	33	Post	C	L	F	4	4	N	28.58
P8	33	NP	CVD	30	Post	C	L	T	3	3	Y	27.10
P9	37	NP	UAH	38	Post	C	L	T	1	1	N	23.11
P10	37	NP	PE	32	Post	C	L	T	1	1	N	25.81
P11	40	NP	IH	30	Post	C	L	T	2	0	N	24.34
P12	39	NP	S	32	Post	C	L	T	2	1	N	22.89
P13	41	NP	PREEC/EC	37	Post	C	L	T	4	4	Y	24.52
P14	29	NP	CVD	35	Post	C	L	T	3	2	Y	30.86
P15	30	NP	S	32	Post	C	L	T	3	3	Y	25.71
P16	32	P	PE	32	Pre	C	D	T	3	2	N	23.24
P17	40	P	PE	17	Pre	IDF	D	T	10	1	N	30.82
P18	21	P	S	27	Post	C	L	T	1	1	N	39.09
P19	37	P	S	26	Post	C	L	T	3	3	N	39.33
P20	27	P	PE	27	Post	C	L	T	1	1	N	26.78
P21	39	P	PE	29	Post	C	L	T	5	4	N	21.08
P22	44	P	CVD	28	Post	C	L	T	3	3	N	26.50
P23	34	P	CVD	9	Pre	IDF	D	T	1	0	N	23.31
P24	31	P	AFE	39	Pre	C	D	T	1	0	N	24.46
P25	22	P	AP	27	Post	C	L	T	1	1	N	26.08
P26	32	P	PE	26	Post	V	L	T	2	1	N	20.61
P27	30	P	PE	27	Post	C	L	T	5	5	N	23.11
P28	37	P	CVD	24	Post	C	L	T	2	1	N	22.83
P29	32	NP	PREEC/EC	39	Post	C	L	F	3	3	N	23.15
P30	41	P	PREEC/EC	30	Post	C	L	T	8	6	N	26.95
P31	34	P	CVD	28	Post	V	D	T	1	0	N	25.96
P32	30	P	P	24	Post	C	D	F	4	3	N	33.30
P33	27	U	U	35	Pre	C	D	T	1	0	N	30.86

P/NP, Preventable/Non-preventable; GW, Gestational week; G, Gravida; P, Parity; BMI, Body mass index; U, Undefined; AFE, Amniotic Fluid Embolism; CVD, Cardiovascular Disorder; AP, Acute pancreatitis; IH, Intracranial Hemorrhage; UAH, Uterine Atony/Hemorrhage; PE, Pulmonary Emboli; S, Septicemia; PREEC/EC, Preeclampsia/Eclampsia; PN, Pneumonia; Pre, Prenatal; Post, Post-natal; C, Cesarean; V, Vaginal; IDF, Intrauterine death of fetus; L, Live; D, Dead; T, Turkish; F, Foreign; Y, Yes; N, No.

and neighbors several less-developed cities. Therefore, the number of transfers to the hospitals in Kayseri is relatively high. Kayseri is in an important location regarding this, and the maternal mortality rate has been higher in our city for these reasons. Turkish data on maternal deaths does not include refugee or foreign national patients. We preferred including foreign national mothers in this study so that we could observe the data regarding the reasons.

The maternal mortality rate was 313/100,000 in a study performed in Pakistan and 84/100,000 in Egypt [11, 12]. In a study performed in the United States of America, the rate increased by three times from 1990 (8/100,000) to 2019 (20.1/100,000) [13]. As seen, maternal mortality rates in undeveloped countries are high and have not de-

clined to the desired rates in several developed countries. Although the rates, according to our city's data, are much better than undeveloped countries, they are still not low enough. Health directors must do their part to increase access to healthcare services and their quality.

The mean age of mothers who died in our study was 33.3. While the mean age among maternal deaths was 28.6 years in a study in Mexico[14], 75% were between the ages of 21 and 30 in a study in India [15]. The median age was 29 in the study by Clark *et al.* [16].

Maternal deaths are classified according to their causes and delay models identified by the WHO. There was a delay in 53.1% of maternal deaths occurring in our city. No Delay Model 2 was observed in our region. While



Table 3. Assessment by Preventability.

	Table C. 1135e55mene by 1	- c · c			
		Preventable	Non-preventable		
Characteristics	Variables	Maternal	Maternal	<i>p</i> -value	
		Mortality (%)	Mortality (%)		
	2015	2 (11.8)	9 (60.0)		
	2016	4 (23.5)	3 (20.0)		
Year	2017	4 (23.5)	1 (6.7)	0.042	
	2018	1 (5.9)	1 (6.7)		
	2019	6 (35.3)	1 (6.7)		
	Spring	3 (17.6)	7 (46.7)		
Season	Summer	1 (5.9)	6 (40.0)	0.004	
Season	Autumn	5 (29.4)	1 (6.7)	0.004	
	Winter	8 (47.1)	1 (6.7)		
N. C. P.	Turkish	15 (88.2)	13 (86.7)	0.650	
Nationality	Foreign	2 (11.8)	2 (13.3)	0.650	
	Kayseri	13 (81.3)	13 (83.3)		
City	Out-of-Town	4 (18.8)	2 (16.7)	0.392	
	Central	10 (76.5)	12 (86.7)		
District	Peripheral	3 (23.5)	1 (13.3)	0.297	
	Yes	11 (64.7)	11 (73.3)		
Follow-up in Primary Care	No	6 (35.3)	4 (26.7)	0.445	
	Primary School	6 (35.3)	5 (33.3)		
	Secondary School	1 (5.9)	3 (20.0)		
	High School	4 (23.5)	3 (20.0)		
Educational Status	University	3 (17.6)	2 (13.3)	0.804	
	Unknown	2 (12.5)	2 (11.1)		
	Illiterate	1 (5.9)	0 (0)		
	Tertiary Care	13 (76.5)	7 (46.7)		
Place of Death	Secondary Care	3 (17.6)	6 (40.0)	0.221	
Thee of Beam	Out of Healthcare Institution	1 (5.9)	2 (13.3)	0.221	
	Cesarean	13 (76.5)	12 (80.0)		
Type of Delivery	Vaginal	2 (11.8)	12 (80.0)	0.883	
	Intrauterine Death of Fetus	2 (11.8)	2 (13.3)		
Period of Death	Prenatal	4 (23.5)	3 (20.0)	0.576	
	Postpartum	13 (76.5)	12 (80.0)		
Pregnancy Outcome				0.154	
Pregnancy Outcome	Live	11 (64.7)	13 (86.7)	0.154	
	Live Dead	11 (64.7) 6 (35.3)	13 (86.7) 2 (13.3)	0.154	
Edomo					
Edema	Dead	6 (35.3)	2 (13.3)	0.154	
	Dead No	6 (35.3) 14 (82.4)	2 (13.3) 11 (73.3)	0.424	
Edema Varicosis	Dead No Unknown	6 (35.3) 14 (82.4) 3 (17.6)	2 (13.3) 11 (73.3) 4 (26.7)		
	Dead No Unknown No	6 (35.3) 14 (82.4) 3 (17.6) 14 (82.4)	2 (13.3) 11 (73.3) 4 (26.7) 11 (73.3)	0.424	

The chi-square test and Fisher's exact test were used.

the first phase delay model was high in preventable maternal deaths, the third phase delay model was higher in non-preventable maternal deaths. Factors such as the presence of refugees in our country and communication problems they experience [17] may have caused delays in healthcare services and, thereby, such a rate in the first phase delay model.

In our study, mostly indirect causes resulted in maternal death. It was reported in a comprehensive study, including the years from 2003 to 2009, that about three-fourths of maternal deaths worldwide were caused by direct factors, and one-fourth were caused by indirect factors [14,18]. The most common direct causes of maternal mortality were preeclampsia, thromboembolism, sudden death



Table 4. Assessment by Preventability -2.

		D	NI		
Characteristics	X7	Preventable	Non-preventable	1	
Characteristics	Variables	Maternal	Maternal	<i>p</i> -value	
		Mortality (%)	Mortality (%)		
Previous C/S	Yes	0 (0)	6 (40.0)	0.006	
Tievious C/3	No	17 (100)	9 (60.0)	0.000	
First Phase Delay	Yes	10 (58.8)	1 (6.7)	0.002	
First Phase Delay	No	7 (41.2)	14 (93.3)		
Third Dhase Delev	Yes	7 (41.2)	0 (0)	0.006	
Third Phase Delay	No	10 (58.8)	15 (100.0)		
D.1 M. 1.1 (4.4.1)	Yes	16 (94.1)	1 (6.7)	-0.001	
Delay Model (total)	No	1 (5.9)	14 (93.3)	< 0.001	
	Yes	9 (52.9)	7 (46.7)	0.939	
Disease Detected during Pregnancy	No	7 (41.2)	7 (46.7)		
	Unknown	1 (5.9)	1 (6.7)		
	0	5 (29.4)	6 (40.0)		
News to a CD'd. Forton	1	7 (41.2)	4 (26.7)	0.414	
Number of Risk Factors	2	4 (23.5)	3 (20.0)		
	3 and more	1 (5.9)	2 (13.3)		
	Direct	5 (29.4)	3 (20.0)	0.40:	
Classification of Causes of Death	Indirect	12 (70.6)	12 (80.0)	0.421	
	Acute Pancreatitis	1 (6.3)	1 (6.3)		
	Pulmonary Emboli	6 (37.5)	1 (6.3)		
	CVD	4 (25.0)	5 (31.3)		
	Intracranial Hemorrhage	0 (0)	2 (12.5)		
Cause of Death	Pneumonia	1 (6.3)	0 (0)	0.341	
	Uterine Atony/Hemorrhage	0 (0)	2 (12.5)		
	Preeclampsia/Eclampsia	1 (6.3)	2 (12.5)		
	Amniotic Fluid Embolism	1 (6.3)	1 (6.3)		
	Septicemia	2 (12.5)	2 (12.5)		

The chi-square test and Fisher's exact test were used. Previous C/S, Previous Cesarean; CVD, Cardiovascular Disorder.

Table 5. Assessment of vital signs and Hb values by preventability.

	Preventable Maternal Mortality	Non-Preventable Maternal Mortality	<i>p</i> -value	
	median (min-max)/mean + SD	median (min-max)/mean + SD		
Weight*	68.5 ± 20.9	66.3 ± 12.2	0.993	
SBP	110 (90–130)	100 (90–130)	0.373	
DBP	70 (50–80)	65 (40–80)	0.829	
Pulse	78 (72–86)	87 (76–105)	0.009	
Hb	12.8 (9.9–15.7)	12 (10.9–14.2)	0.033	

Mann-Whitney U and Independent Student *T*-tests* were used. SBP, Systolic Blood Pressure; DBP, Diastolic Blood Pressure; Hb, Hemoglobin; SD, Standard Deviation.

during pregnancy, sepsis, obstetric hemorrhage, and amniotic fluid embolism. Cardiovascular disorders were the most common indirect cause of death [14,16,19,20]. In our study, while cardiovascular disorders were the most common indirect causes, pulmonary thromboembolism was the most common direct cause. Direct and indirect causes of maternal mortality were similar to findings in the literature. As the experience and knowledge of healthcare personnel increase, direct maternal deaths can be reduced. Most indi-

rect causes are generally the most common health problems worldwide. Cardiovascular disorders (CVD) may cause delays in diagnosis as normal pregnancy symptoms correspond to the symptoms of CVD and thereby cause maternal mortality [21].

Our study group had a high cesarean rate (66.7%). Studies revealed that cesarean birth increased the risk of maternal mortality [22]. It was observed that the increasing risk was mostly caused by infection, thromboembolism



and anesthesia complications. It can be concluded that cesarean increases the risk of maternal mortality even if the causes are indirect [23].

In our study, 75.8% of deaths occurred during the postpartum period. In a study performed in Syria, 54% of deaths occurred during labor or delivery, and 32% occurred during postpartum [24]. In a study in Mexico, 65.5% of mothers died after delivery [14]. The high mortality rate during pregnancy in Syria may be because abortion is banned there and individuals use illegal means.

Our study's mean gestational week of mothers who died during pregnancy was 24.5. It was 34.2 in a study in our country [25]. In our study, mothers died in earlier gestational weeks.

The rate of mothers with no primary care follow-up before delivery was 25.4%, and the mean number of visits was 2.8. The rate of mothers who had never been followed up was 6.1%. The rate of prenatal visits in developing countries may differ from 12% to 39% [26,27]. It is pleasing that the rate of pregnant women without follow-up was low in our study.

In our study, there was a delay model in 53.1% of maternal deaths, which were first-phase and third-phase delay models. None of the local or foreign women had a second-phase delay model. In a study performed in Egypt, the third-phase delay was observed in 88.9% of the cases, second-phase delay in 50% and first-phase delay only in 6.3% [28]. In a study in Sweden, the third-phase delay model was the most common cause of maternal mortality [17]. There was first-phase delay in Sweden-born deaths, while the second-phase delay model was detected only in foreign groups [17]. It is observed that the prevalence of first and second-phase delay models decreases as the level of socioeconomic development of countries and individuals increases.

Our study has discussed maternal deaths, which are an important health problem. However, it has some limitations. Pregnant women's detailed records on delivery and operation and data on whether vaginal delivery of the pregnant women was performed with induction could not be obtained.

5. Conclusions

As seen in our study, the rates of preventable maternal mortality are considerably high. The first-phase delay model has an important place in preventable maternal deaths. Individuals must have knowledge and awareness of risks and protection during pregnancy, starting from consultancy services before pregnancy and adapt to their routine follow-ups in healthcare institutions and directions of healthcare personnel throughout the process.

Awareness of pregnant women on frequent maternal deaths in our region can be raised by training provided in pregnancy schools, etc. Family physicians can be encouraged to more closely follow up pre-pregnancy, prenatal and postpartum processes of individuals in the reproductive age group, considering their health conditions, and more ac-

tively play a consulting and directive role. Studies on the causes of maternal deaths and associated factors will contribute to the planning of future healthcare services.

Availability of Data and Materials

Datasets are available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request after permission from the local authorities.

Author Contributions

HA, MBG, and SO conceived the manuscript, oversaw the data collection, and conducted the analyses. MBG and SO wrote the manuscript. MBG participated in the study design, data analyses and interpretations, critically revised the manuscript. All authors contributed to editorial changes in the manuscript. All authors read and approved the final manuscript. All authors have participated sufficiently in the work and agreed to be accountable for all aspects of the work.

Ethics Approval and Consent to Participate

Institutional consent for the study was obtained from the Kayseri Provincial Health Directorate, and ethical approval was obtained from the Ethics Committee of Kayseri City Training and Research Hospital (Decision Number: 243, Date: 24.10.2020). Our study is retrospective and no voluntary consent form was obtained.

Acknowledgment

Thanks to all the peer reviewers for their opinions and suggestions.

Funding

This research received no external funding.

Conflict of Interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

- [1] World Health Organization. Maternal Mortality. 2022. Available at: https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/maternal-mortality (Accessed: 9 March 2022).
- [2] Nour NM. An introduction to maternal mortality. Reviews in Obstetrics & Gynecology. 2008; 1: 77–81.
- [3] Shen C, Williamson JB. Maternal mortality, women's status, and economic dependency in less developed countries: a crossnational analysis. Social Science & Medicine (1982). 1999; 49: 197–214.
- [4] Thaddeus S, Maine D. Too far to walk: maternal mortality in context. Social science & medicine. 1994; 38: 1091–110.
- [5] Kumari K, Srivastava RK, Srivastava M, Purwar N. Maternal Mortality in Rural Varanasi: Delays, Causes, and Contributing Factors. Indian journal of community medicine. 2019; 44: 26– 30.
- [6] Collier AY, Molina RL. Maternal Mortality in the United States: Updates on Trends, Causes, and Solutions. Neoreviews. 2019; 20: e561–e574.



- [7] Ozimek JA, Kilpatrick SJ. Maternal Mortality in the Twenty-First Century. Obstet Gynecol Clin North Am. 2018; 45: 175– 186
- [8] Turkish Statistical Institute. Birth Statistics. 2020. Available at: https://data.tuik.gov.tr/Bulten/Index?p=Dogum-Istatistikler i-2020-37229 (Accessed: 2 May 2022).
- [9] Høj L, da Silva D, Hedegaard K, Sandström A, Aaby P. Maternal mortality: only 42 days? BJOG: an International Journal of Obstetrics and Gynaecology. 2003; 110: 995–1000.
- [10] Turkish Statistical Institute. World Population Day, 2020. 2020. Available at: https://data.tuik.gov.tr/Bulten/Index?p=Dunya-N ufus-Gunu-2020-33707 (Accessed: 5 May 2022).
- [11] Pasha O, Saleem S, Ali S, Goudar SS, Garces A, Esamai F, et al. Maternal and newborn outcomes in Pakistan compared to other low and middle income countries in the Global Network's Maternal Newborn Health Registry: an active, community-based, pregnancy surveillance mechanism. Reproductive Health. 2015; 12 Suppl 2: S15.
- [12] Gipson R, El MA, Campbell O, Issa AH, Matta N, Mansour E. The trend of maternal mortality in Egypt from 1992-2000: an emphasis on regional differences. Maternal and Child Health Journal. 2005; 9: 71–82.
- [13] Wang S, Rexrode KM, Florio AA, Rich-Edwards JW, Chavarro JE. Maternal Mortality in the United States: Trends and Opportunities for Prevention. Annual Review of Medicine. 2023; 74: 199–216.
- [14] Romero-Gutiérrez G, Espitia-Vera A, Ponce-Ponce de León AL, Huerta-Vargas LF. Risk factors of maternal death in Mexico. Birth (Berkeley, Calif.). 2007; 34: 21–25.
- [15] Puri A, Yadav I, Jain N. Maternal mortality in an urban tertiary care hospital of north India. The Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology of India. 2011; 61: 280–285.
- [16] Clark SL, Belfort MA, Dildy GA, Herbst MA, Meyers JA, Hankins GD. Maternal death in the 21st century: causes, prevention, and relationship to cesarean delivery. American Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology. 2008; 199: 36.e1–e11.
- [17] Esscher A, Binder-Finnema P, Bødker B, Högberg U, Mulic-Lutvica A, Essén B. Suboptimal care and maternal mortality among foreign-born women in Sweden: maternal death audit

- with application of the 'migration three delays' model. BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth. 2014; 14: 141.
- [18] Say L, Chou D, Gemmill A, Tunçalp Ö, Moller AB, Daniels J, et al. Global causes of maternal death: a WHO systematic analysis. The Lancet. Global Health. 2014; 2: e323–e333.
- [19] Schutte JM, Steegers EAP, Schuitemaker NWE, Santema JG, de Boer K, Pel M, et al. Rise in maternal mortality in the Netherlands. BJOG: an International Journal of Obstetrics and Gynaecology. 2010; 117: 399–406.
- [20] Khan KS, Wojdyla D, Say L, Gülmezoglu AM, Van Look PF. WHO analysis of causes of maternal death: a systematic review. Lancet (London, England). 2006; 367: 1066–1074.
- [21] Chambers ME, De Zoysa MY, Hameed AB. Screening for Cardiovascular Disease in Pregnancy: Is There a Need? Journal of Cardiovascular Development and Disease. 2022; 9: 89.
- [22] Deneux-Tharaux C, Carmona E, Bouvier-Colle MH, Bréart G. Postpartum maternal mortality and cesarean delivery. Obstetrics and Gynecology. 2006; 108: 541–548.
- [23] Lawson GW. Report of a breech cesarean section maternal death. Birth. 2011; 38: 159–161.
- [24] Bashour H, Abdulsalam A, Jabr A, Cheikha S, Tabbaa M, Lahham M, et al. Maternal mortality in Syria: causes, contributing factors and preventability. Tropical Medicine & International Health: TM & IH. 2009; 14: 1122–1127.
- [25] Batmaz İ, Kavak SB, Kavak EÇ, Evrim G, Sanlı C, Bulu G, et al. Elazig ilinde 2015-2020 yillari arasında meydana gelen anne ölümlerinin degerlendirilmesi. Perinatal Journal/Perinatoloji Dergisi. 2020; 28: 183–189.
- [26] Bashour H, Kharouf M, DeJong J. Childbirth Experiences and Delivery Care During Times of War: Testimonies of Syrian Women and Doctors. Frontiers in Global Women's Health. 2021; 2: 605634.
- [27] Onyeajam DJ, Xirasagar S, Khan MM, Hardin JW, Odutolu O. Antenatal care satisfaction in a developing country: a cross-sectional study from Nigeria. BMC Public Health. 2018; 18: 368.
- [28] Mohammed MM, El Gelany S, Eladwy AR, Ali El, Gadelrab MT, Ibrahim EM, *et al.* A ten year analysis of maternal deaths in a tertiary hospital using the three delays model. BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth. 2020; 20: 585.

